

Minutes of Pre-bid Meeting convened by TUFIDCO for Appointment of Programme Management Consultant for the implementation of Smart City Projects in Madurai, Thanjavur and Vellore - Tamil Nadu held on 27.03.2017 at 03:30 PM in the O/o TUFIDCO.

List of Consultants

Mr. D. Uthaya Kumar

M/s. DORSCH Consultant India Pvt Ltd.,

Mr. R. Nataraja

M/s. SAI Consulting Engineers Pvt Ltd.,

Mr. N. Selva Kumar

M/s. Wadia Techno- Engineering Services Ltd

Mr. Darshan Parikh

M/s. CRISIL Risk & Infrastructure Solutions Limited

Ms. Arjun Charles

M/s. Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu India LLP

Mr. Arun Moral

M/s. Pricewaterhouse Coopers Pvt Ltd.,

Mr. S. Sriram

M/s. Pricewaterhouse Coopers Pvt Ltd.,

Commissionerate of Municipal Administration

Mr. N.M. Krishnamoorthy

Assistant Executive Engineer

Tamil Nadu Urban Finance Infrastructure Development Corporation

Dr. R.Murugan

Deputy General Manager

Mr.S. Manivannan

Assistant Manager

Mr. A.L. Radhakrishnan

Chief Engineer (Rt) – State Mission Management Unit (Smart & AMRUT Cities)

Purpose of the Meeting:

Pre-Bid Meeting for Programme Management Consultant for the Implementation of Smart City Projects in Madurai, Thanjavur and Vellore - Tamil Nadu

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
1		General		Kindly clarify if the Consultant can form a Consortium to leverage on specific strengths of various firms. The RFP document does not specify whether Consortium is allowed. Kindly allow a consortium of not more than 3 firms. Also, in case a consortium is allowed, the experience of all the firms who are part of the Consortium should be considered for eligibility as well as technical evaluation.	Please refer clause 2.9 in RFP – Joint Venture – Not Allowed
2	Page 27	Section 2.28	Details of Experience Requirement no. 2: Experience of providing PMU support for urban infrastructure sectors at state level	Given that the Programme Management Consultant will be working with the relevant cities for Smart City Proposal implementation, experience of working with the Urban Local Body as a PIU/PMU is extremely relevant. We request you to include PIU/PMU at the city level to encourage wider competition.	Experience of providing PMU support for urban infrastructure sectors at state / City level is also considered.
3	Page 27	Section 2.28	Details of Experience Requirement no. 3: Experience in PMU support for JNNURM/SMART City/ AMRUT cities at state level	State level PMUs for Govt programmes are very few. Most states have chosen the direct recruitment route and appointed experts in specific positions. Also, kindly clarify if a currently ongoing PMU mandate at the Central/State Govt. level will be considered as eligible under this criteria. Additionally, we request you to include PMU for JNNURM/Smart City/AMRUT at the city level to encourage competition.	On-going PMU at State/ City Level will be considered.
4	Page 27	Section 2.28	Details of Experience Requirement no. 4: Experience in proof checking / project appraisal of DPR for various urban infrastructure projects such as Non-Motorized Transport (Project Cost at least Rs.10 Cr) / Multi-Level Car	Management consulting firms do not have such experience. This is done largely by engineering firms. We request you to allow a Consortium of not more than 3 firms which will allow leveraging this experience.	No change. RFP Condition prevail.

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
			Parking (Project Cost at least Rs. 20 Cr) / Sewerage/ water supply / roads/SWM /SWD)(each project cost of at least Rs. 100 Crores)		
5	Page 28	Section 2.28 (6)	Experience in arranging finances for state level undertakings/ state financial institutions in last 5 years ending on 31/03/2016	Typically management consulting firms do not support raising of finances for PSUs/SFIs. This is largely done by bankers and other financing institutions. We request you to kindly remove this criteria which will enable mainstream consulting firms to participate in the bidding process.	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
6	Page 36	Appendix 4	Technical Qualification Criteria Completion Certificate	Kindly clarify if completion certificates are mandatory. We suggest that in cases where completion certificates are not available, a certificate issued by a Chartered Accountant of the receipt of total assignment fee should also be considered. Kindly clarify if in case of ongoing assignments, a copy of the agreement / LOI will suffice.	Completion Certificate from the Client is necessary for evaluation.
7	Page 64	Section 8: Terms of Reference – Teaming Requirement		The note below the table on teaming requirements indicates that the expert should be conversant with both English and Tamil languages. We request you to kindly remove the requirement for Tamil language fluency. Such requirement restricts the universe of experts which can be positioned for any of the proposals. English language fluency should suffice the requirement.	The expert shall be well conversant with English/ Tamil Language.
8		General – Date of submission		We request that the date of submission is at least 3 weeks from the date of issue of clarifications.	The Last date for submission of document is April 25th 2017

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
9	Page 5	Section 1 of Letter of Invitation Clause 4	A firm will be selected under the Least Cost Selection (LCS) and in the proposal format as described in this RFP	We request you to kindly consider QCBS evaluation with 80:20 (Technical: Financial) Weightage	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
		Section 1 of letter of Invitation; Clause 6	The bids shall be accepted through Physical form as described in this RFP (Clause 6 of Section 1		
10	Page 16	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (C); Clause 20.1	The consultant shall submit a signed and complete proposal comprising the documents and forms in accordance with clause 10 (Documents comprising Proposal). The submission shall be Physically (hard copy) as well as online (Clause 20.1 of Section 2	Please clarify whether is the submission is Physical submission OR Online as well as Physical Submission	Only Physical form of Submission is accepted.
11	Page 7 & Page 24	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.9	Joint Venture (JV) Not allowed	We request Joint venture be allowed We request for 3 member consortium including lead member	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
12	Page 7 & Page 27	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.26	Financial Eligibility: a) Company should have minimum Average Annual Turnover of Indian Rupees (INR) 100 (Hundred) Crore in the last three financial years 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16.	We request to consider this condition as "Any member of the JV/Consortium can have minimum Average Annual Turnover of Indian Rupees (INR) 100 (Hundred) Crore in the last three financial years 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16.	Financial Eligibility: a) Company should have minimum Average Annual Turnover of Indian Rupees (INR) 50 (Fifty) Crore in the last three financial years 2013-14, 2014-15 and 2015-16.

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
13	Page 7 & Page 27	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.28 (1)	Details of experience, Experience of preparing Smart City proposal and getting selected in Round 1,2& in Fast Track of smart city challenge:	We request you to kindly consider "Experience in preparing Smart City proposal under the MoUD Mission"	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
14	Page 7 & Page 21	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.28 (2)	Details of experience of providing PMU support for urban infrastructure sectors at State level	"Experience of providing PMU/PMC/ Design/Construction Supervision support for urban infrastructure sectors at State level"	Experience of providing PMU support for urban infrastructure sectors at state / City level is also considered.
15	Page 5 & Page 27	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.28 (2)	Details of experience in PMU for JnNURM/ SMART CITY/ and AMRUT Cities at State Level	We request you to kindly consider "Experience in PMU/PMC/ Design/Construction Supervision for JnNURM/ SMART CITY/ and AMRUT Cities at State Level"	On-going PMU at State/ City Level will be considered.
16	Page 7 & Page 27	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.28 (3)	Details of experience in PMU for JnNURM/ SMART CITY/ and AMRUT Cities at State Level	We request you to kindly consider projects under World Bank and ADB Funding	Experience in PMU for JnNURM/ SMART CITY/ World Bank/ ADB and AMRUT Cities at State/City Level will be considered
17	Page 7 & Page 28	Section 2: Instructions	Experience in proof checking / project appraisal of DPR for	We request you to kindly consider Experience in Design/PMC/Supervision/proof checking / project	No change. RFP Condition prevails.

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
		to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.28 (5)	various urban infrastructure projects such as Non-Motorized Transport (Project Cost at least Rs.10 Cr) / Multi-Level Car Parking (Project Cost at least Rs. 20 Cr) / Sewerage/ water supply / roads/SWM /SWD)(each project cost of at least Rs. 100 Crores) Maximum two projects in each sectors only will be considered)	appraisal of DPR for various urban infrastructure projects We request you to kindly consider road projects having project cost of INR 90 Crore	
18	Page 7 & Page 28	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.28	If the consultant is willing to submit proposal for all the cities, then the consultant has to submit one technical proposal with different team composition indicated in clause 2.28 in Data Sheet with two separate sealed financial proposals.	We understand the RFP is invited for three cities. Hence the clause shall be read as "If the consultant is willing to submit proposal for all the cities, then the consultant has to submit one technical proposal with different team composition indicated in clause 2.28 in Data Sheet with three separate sealed financial proposals" Please confirm	If the Bidder is interested to participate for two cities (Madurai and Thanjavur), the bidder should submit one technical proposal with two separate teams and two financial proposals.
19	Page 7 & Page 29	Section 2: Instructions to Consultant and Data Sheet (E); Clause 2.30 (a)	"The Client will select the Consultant quoted the lowest cost among those that passed the minimum technical score " Further, as quality is the principal selection criterion, the TUFIDCO does not bind itself in any way to select the firm offering the lowest price	We request you to kindly consider QCBS Selection with 80:20 (Technical: Commercial)	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
20			Capability, Experience and Qualifications of key personnel as per tender requirements:	The requirement of a "Finance Expert", as part of the team, has not been provided. Please provide clarity on the reason/ rationale behind the same.	There is no Financial Expert as part of the team.

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
	Page 28	Clause 2.28 (7)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Team Leader and Urban Management Expert · Urban Infrastructure Expert · Transportation Specialist · PPP & Procurement and Contracts Expert 		
21	Page 24	Clause 2.9	Joint Venture (JV) Not Allowed	We request /suggest to allow Joint Venture to undertake the project	No change. RFP Condition prevails
22	Page 27	Clause 2.28.1	Experience of preparing Smart City Proposal and getting selected in Round 1,2 in Fast Track of Smart City Challenge	Since this is an implementation project, it is suggested that this may be kept as Pre-Qualification Criteria as follows: Atleast one Smart City Proposal(SCP). Out of 60 Smart Cities of Smart City Challenge be selected in Round1,2 & in Fast Track. While we also suggest that shortlisted bidder should be asked to make presentation on Approach & Methodology and marks allotted to this experience should be allotted to this Presentation.	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
23	Page 27	Clause 2.28.2	Experience of providing PMU support for urban infrastructure sector at state level	We suggest to consider:- Experience of providing PMU Support/PMC for Urban Infrastructure sector or Area Development projects at city/state level	Experience of providing PMU support for urban infrastructure sector at state / City level will be considered.
24	Page 27	Clause 2.28.3	Experience in PMU for JnNURM/SMART CITY/ and AMRUT cities at state level	We suggest to consider:- Experience in any of the following projects with project cost not less than Rs.100 Crore <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Water Supply System ii) Sewerage System iii) Urban Transport iv) Solid Waste Management 	No change. RFP Condition prevails

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
25	Page 27	Clause 2.28.4	Experiencing in completing PPP projects in any infrastructure sector of minimum Rs. 30 Crores in single project (Projects where Lol for developer issued/concession agreement executed between parties)	We suggest to consider:- Experience in undertaking PPP Projects (completed/ongoing) in any Infrastructure Sector of minimum Rs.30 Crores in single project (projects where Lol for developer issued/concession agreement executed between parties/construction work completed)	No change. RFP Condition prevails
26	Page 28	Clause 2.28.5	Experience in proof checking / project appraisal of DPR for various urban infrastructure projects such as Non-Motorized Transport (Project Cost at least Rs.10 Cr) / Multi-Level Car Parking (Project Cost at least Rs. 20 Cr) / Sewerage/ water supply / roads/SWM /SWD)(each project cost of at least Rs. 100 Crores) Maximum two projects in each sectors only will be considered)	We suggest that;-Experience in assessment of existing infrastructure, Feasibility Study, Detailed Design/Engineering, Technical/Design Review, Development of improvement Strategies, etc., shall also be considered.	Experience in proof checking / project appraisal/Review of DPR for various urban infrastructure projects will also be considered for evaluation, for projects such as Non-Motorized Transport (Project Cost at least Rs.10 Cr) / Multi-Level Car Parking (Project Cost at least Rs. 20 Cr) / Sewerage/ water supply / roads/SWM /SWD)(each project cost of at least Rs. 100 Crores) Maximum two projects in each sectors only will be considered)
27	Page 28	Clause 2.28.6	Experience in arranging finances for state level undertakings/ state financial institutions in last 5 years ending on 31/03/2016 for Urban Infrastructure Projects	As per MOUD guidelines, cost of elements & financing of them is a part of SCP. Hence, plan for arranging of finance is presumed to be already addressed and hence this request may dropped.	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
28	Page 28 Page 67	Clause 2.59	The expert shall be well conversant with English and Tamil Language	It is preferable to have knowledge of Tamil Language. However, it is suggested that 'no knowledge' of Tamil should not disqualify the expert. You have demand certain percentage (%) of experts to have knowledge of Tamil language but not in case of all experts.	The expert shall be well conversant with English/ Tamil Language
29	Page 68		The total duration of the Project shall be 48 (Forty Eight) months	Kindly clarify whether the total duration of the project includes the Defect Liability Period	The total duration of the Project shall be 48 (Forty Eight) months.

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
SAI Consulting Engineers Pvt Ltd					
30	Page 23	Clause 2.1	Method of Selection – Least Cost Selection	We understand the Authority to appoint best Technical Consultant. Hence, it is desirable to shift to QCBs method as selection of the consultant. It is very unfair to have the selection method as LCS looking to the National Importance of the Project.	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
31	Page 24	Clause 2.8	Statement of Undertaking	There is standard statement of undertaking, stating the “We confirm that in competing for (and, if the award is made to us, in executing) the Contract, we undertake to observe the laws against fraud and corruption, including bribery, in force in the country of the client”. We believe that this should be part of the proposal	Yes. It is part of the proposal.
32	Page 24	Clause 2.9	Joint Venture	We request to allow the JV. It is also in favour of the Authority to have the combination of best consultants on board for the very prestigious smart city assignments	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
33	Page 25	Clause 2.17	Price Adjustment	Since the assignment tenure is more than 18 months, we request to allow the price adjustment	No change. RFP Condition prevails.
34	Page 26	Clause 2.25	Online Submission/	All Smart City (other important) assignments are/were with online submission. Kindly allow the same	Physical form of Submission is only accepted.
35	Page 27	Clause 2.28	Experience of preparing Smart City Proposal and getting selected in Round 1& 2 in Fast Track of Smart city challenge Experience in PMU for JnNURM/Smart City/and AMRUT Cities at State Level	This clause eliminates other good bidders. The Authority should allow bidders having requisite experience in Project Management Consultancy of funded infrastructure projects (roads, water & sanitation, urban transport). This becomes monopolize if only consultants who provided services to Smart Cities projects are eligible. This arrangement is for Project Management and nothing to do with preparation of Smart City Proposal.	Experience in PMU for JnNURM/ SMART CITY/ World Bank/ ADB and AMRUT Cities at State /City Level will be considered.

S.N.	RFP Page. N.	Reference	As per RFP	Query / Clarifications	Reply
				This clause also restrict the competition since very few PMC of Smart City/AMRUT projects have been awarded	
36		Clause 2.2	Appointment of Programme Management Consultant for the Implementation of Smart City Projects in Madurai, Thanjavur and Vellore		The clause 2.2 can be read as following; Appointment of Programme Management Consultant for the Implementation of Smart City Projects in Madurai and Thanjavur. The consultants are requested to submit the proposal for Madurai and Thanjavur only.